

MINUTES
NAPERVILLE PLAN COMMISSION
July 15, 2009 - 7:00 P.M. – COUNCIL CHAMBERS

Call to Order (7:02 p.m.)

A. Roll Call

Commissioners Present: Chairman Mike Brown, Commissioner's Ann Edmonds, Patricia Gustin, John Herzog, Bill Jepson, Joe McElroy and Patricia Meyer

Commissioners Absent: Commissioner Reynold Sterlin

Student Member Present: Michael Alber

Student Member Absent: Amit Walia

Staff Present: Director TED Business Group – Marcie Schatz
Planning Team Operations Mgrs –Allison Laff & Suzanne Thorsen
Community Planner – Rory Fancler
Project Engineer – Jennifer Louden
Project Assistant – Dina Hagen

B. Approve Minutes

June 17, 2009

Motion to approve by: Gustin Seconded by: Jepson Approved (7 to 0)

July 1, 2009

Motion to approve by: Jepson Seconded by: Herzog Approved (7 to 0)

C. Old Business - None

D. Public Hearings

PC Case # 1711: 5th Avenue Study

Petitioner: City of Naperville

Location: Parcels in the immediate vicinity of the Naperville train station and parcels fronting both sides of Washington Street between Benton Avenue and Ogden Avenue

Request: Recommend approval of the *5th Avenue Study*, which includes a future land use map of the study area and supplemental future land use recommendations.

(The Official Notices for PC Case #1711 were published in the Naperville Sun on May 31, 2009, June 10, 2009 and June 14, 2009.)

Staff Presentation: Ms. Fancler of staff provided an overview of the supplemental information provided in response to the Plan Commission discussion and public comments received at the June 17, 2009 meeting noting that a future land use map and supplemental land use recommendations had been incorporated into the report. Ms Fancler stated that recommendations have been developed for each of the three components of the study: future land use, transportation and streetscape. The Plan Commission is being asked to focus comments on the future land use recommendations.

Public Testimony: 11 members of the public gave input on the 5th Avenue Study.

- Russ Whitaker, 123 Water Street, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- David Shaftman, 1821 South Washington Street #310, Naperville, Illinois 60565
- Ken Rathje, 412 Chicago Avenue, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Craig Kiefer, 224 E. 4th Avenue, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Bev Frier, 24W035 Donwood Drive, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Dan Slack, 2222 North Elston Avenue Suite 201, Chicago, Illinois 60614
- Dave Wilson, 152 N. Ellsworth, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Dave Trollope, 240 E. 4th Avenue, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Bob Swininoga, 1241 Marls Court, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- JoAnn Smith, 151 N. Ellsworth, Naperville, Illinois 60540
- Tom Higgins, 725 N. Ellsworth, Naperville, Illinois 60540

Major comments from the public included:

- The City's study shows a lack of vision for multi-dwelling high density development, particularly fronting Ellsworth Street, and missed opportunities in the public process to coordinate with regional planning organizations (e.g. CMAP).
- The public input in the study is not representative of Naperville residents at large or Metra riders.
- The appropriateness of high-density residential use in vicinity of Naperville Metra Station.
- Concern was voiced for adequate access to the Naperville Metra Station for non-commuters.
- Residents generally supported a bus depot concept, but concerns were raised regarding the bus routes on residential streets.
- Concerns were raised that the recommendation for the height of new buildings does not consider the grade change along Washington Street.
- Concern about the cost of a parking deck.
- Support for "Medium Density Residential" for properties fronting Ellsworth Street was expressed.
- Support of the future land use designation "Mixed-Use" for the Boecker property.
- Support for future land use designation of "Institutional" as provided in Option B.
- The potential for "Low Density Residential" use on the Kroehler Lot.
- Some residents stated that future redevelopment should have setbacks to reduce the bulk of buildings and provide separation from existing residences.
- A preference for three surface parking lots as opposed to a parking deck was expressed.

Break 8:58 pm

Resume 9:15 pm

Plan Commission Questions/Discussion:

- By consensus the commissioners agreed that “Mixed-Use” for the Boecker property is appropriate.
- Commissioners Edmonds and Herzog agreed that the future land use designation “Mixed-Use” for parcels fronting Ellsworth Street (north of North Avenue) would be appropriate.
- A majority of plan commissioners agreed that the Kroehler Lot and Water Tower West should be designated “Transportation/ Utilities” in order to provide for commuter parking on both sites. Brown and McElroy disagreed.
- Commissioner Meyer questioned the feasibility of parking decks in the context of funding options and construction timelines.
- The commission discussed how changes to specific city-owned parcels would affect the overall supply of commuter parking in the vicinity of the train station. A suggestion was made to add a supplemental recommendation addressing this concern.
- Commissioner Edmonds inquired about removing on-street parking restrictions in order to provide for commuter parking on residential streets.
- Commissioner McElroy stated support for residential use on upper floors of commercial use on Washington Street, north of 5th Avenue. A recommendation was made for an additional supplemental recommendation to address this point.
- Commissioner Gustin received clarification that the height of new buildings are regulated by zoning district and measured based on the datum point. The trend of redevelopment in downtown as it relates to height was also noted.
- Commissioner McElroy also voiced his concern regarding building height.
- Commissioner Gustin confirmed that future rear cross-access easements for properties fronting Washington Street are appropriate.

Motion: Close the public hearing.
 Motion by: Edmonds Seconded by: Jepson
 Approved (7 to 0)

Plan Commission made the following motions for amendments to the future land use map and supplemental recommendations.

Motion: Amend future land use map for properties located on the east side of Ellsworth Street, between 4th Avenue and North Avenue, from “Medium Density Residential” to “Mixed-Use”.
 Motion by: Edmonds Seconded by: Gustin
Not Approved (5 to 2)

Commissioner	Aye	Nay	Rationale
Mike Brown		X	
Ann Edmonds	X		“Mixed Use” a compromise between “High & Medium Density”
Patty Gustin		X	
John Herzog	X		Considers Medium Density too restrictive.
Bill Jepson		X	
Joe McElroy		X	
Patricia Meyer		X	

Motion: Eliminate options A & B for both the Kroehler and Water Tower West site, and replace with an “option C” which designates both properties as “Transportation/ Utilities”.

Motion by: Jepson Seconded by: Edmonds

Approved (5 to 2)

Commissioner	Aye	Nay	Rationale
Mike Brown		X	Options A & B are appropriate and achieve the City’s vision of a limited increase in parking coupled with a multi modal transportation approach.
Ann Edmonds	X		
Patty Gustin	X		
John Herzog	X		
Bill Jepson	X		
Joe McElroy		X	Additional parking is not the “best and highest use.”
Patricia Meyer	X		

Motion: Remove the supplemental recommendation “New buildings on the west side of Washington Street, south of Franklin Avenue, should not exceed the approximate height of the Van Buren Parking Deck (60’).”

Motion by: Meyer Seconded by: Gustin

Approved (6 to 1)

Commissioner	Aye	Nay	Rationale
Mike Brown	X		
Ann Edmonds	X		
Patty Gustin	X		
John Herzog		X	Study area distant from Downtown.
Bill Jepson	X		
Joe McElroy	X		
Patricia Meyer	X		
Reynold Sterlin			

Motion: Add “Consideration should be made for accessory residential units above commercial uses” as a supplemental future land use recommendation.

Motion by: McElroy Seconded by: Herzog

Approved (7 to 0)

Motion: Add “Commuter parking shall be viewed as a system in the evaluation of changes to the future land use for city owned properties” as a supplemental future land use recommendation.

Motion by: Herzog Seconded by: Meyer

Approved (7 to 0)

Motion: Approve 5th Avenue Study Report, which includes a future land use map for the study area and supplemental future land use recommendations

Motion by: Gustin Seconded by: Meyer

Approved (7 to 0)

E. Reports – None

F. Correspondence – None

G. New Business –

- Staff announced that the memo of the Plan Commission recommendation along with DAC and TAB for the 5th Avenue Study is to be presented to City Council August 18, 2009.
- Commissioner Herzog suggested that any future studies regarding parking decks, bus depots or additional parking need more commuter input.
- Commissioner Jepson suggested that more emphasis needs to be given to commuters in Naperville.
- Commissioner Gustin presented NTTC (Naperville Trolley Train Concept) to staff for consideration.

H. Motion to Adjourn

Motion by: Gustin Seconded by: Meyer
Approved (7 to 0)

I. Adjournment – 11:04 pm